

150 West State Street Capitol View Building • Trenton NJ 08608 P: 609-396-0096 • F: 609-396-2463 www.nj-justice.org • info@nj-justice.org

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR** 

Cornelius J. Larkin, CAE, CMP, CEM, CMM, DES

**DIRECTOR OF GOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS EMERITUS** Deborah R. Bozarth

March 26, 2024

PRESIDENT PRESIDENT
Patricial M. Giordano, Camden
Feldman Shepherd Wohlgelerr
Tanner Weinstock Dodig LLP
5 Crooked Lane
Cherry Hill, NJ 08034
PRESIDENT-ELECT PRESIDENT-ELECT
Adam B. Lederman, Bergen
1ST VICE PRESIDENT
Jonathan H. Lomurro, Monmouth
2ND VICE PRESIDENT
& DIVERSITY OFFICER Richard J. Albuquerque, Atlantic 3RD VICE PRESIDENT Diane L. Cardoso, Hudson TREASURER K. Raja Bhatlacharya, Essex SECRETARY Deborah S. Dunn, Burlington ASST. SECRETARY Jared M. Placitella, Monmouth PARLIAMENTARIAN Melissa M. Baxter, Camden IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT James S. Lynch, Bergen
NATIONAL GOVERNORS Lynne M. Kizis, Middlesex

Francisco J. Rodriguez, Union STATE DELEGATES

Francisco J. Rodriguez, Union STATE DELEGATES
Lauren D. Fraser, Sussex
Scott G. Leonard, Morris
BOARD OF GOVERNORS
Northern Region
E. Drew Britcher, Bergen
Michael T. Buonocore, Bergen
Donald A. Caminiti, Bergen
Michael T. Buonocore, Bergen
Donald A. Caminiti, Bergen
Michael J. Maggiano, Bergen
Ellen Relkin, Bergen
Ellen Relkin, Bergen
Garry R. Salomon, Bergen
Ellen Relkin, Bergen
Garry R. Salomon, Bergen
Hard C. Saperstein, Bergen
Schwart P. Capozzi, Essex
Paul M. da Costa, Essex
Corey A. Dietz, Essex
Armo General Sissex
Armo General Sissex
Selley Britander, Hudson
Norberto A. Garcia, Hudson
Norberto A. Garcia, Hudson
Dominick J. Gargano, Hudson
Jonathan Koles, Hudson
Jonathan Ko

Jonathan Koles, Hudson Kathleen M. Reilly, Hudson John S. Hoyt, Morris

John E. Molinari, Morris Michael S. Raff, Passaid Louis J. Serafini, Passaic Timothy E. Dinan, Sussex Christian M. Perrucci. Warre

Christian M. Perrucci, Warren Cantral Region Sitan A. Heyesey, Mercer Tracey C. Hinson, Mercer Bhaveen R. Jani, Mercer Evan J. Lide, Mercer Jeffrey S. Monaghan, Mercer Evan J. Lide, Mercer Rawi Sattirgiu, Mercer Bruce H. Stern, Mercer Rawi Sattirgiu, Mercer Bruce H. Stern, Mercer Christopher P. Weidman, Mercer Christopher P. Weidman, Mercer Glovanni Anzalone, Middlesex Thomas W. Barlow, Middlesex Thomas W. Barlow, Middlesex Daniel N. Epstein, Middlesex

Craig M. Aronow, Middlesex Thomas W. Barlow, Middlesex Daniel N. Epstein, Middlesex Daniel N. Epstein, Middlesex Daniel N. Epstein, Middlesex Michelle M. Tullio, Middlesex Michelle M. Tullio, Middlesex Michelle M. Tullio, Mormouth Dennis A. Drazin, Monmouth Christopher M. Placitella, Monmouth Rachel A. Placitella, Monmouth Gary S. Shapiro, Mommouth William Wright, Ocean Barry R. Sugaman, Somerset Gerald H. Baker, Union Fire G. Kahn, Union Jeffrey A. Rizika, Union Southern Region
Alexa D'Amato Barrera, Atlantic Dara A. Quattrone, Atlantic Dara A. Quattrone, Atlantic Dara A. Quattrone, Atlantic

Dara A. Quattrone, Atlantic Thomas J. Vesper, Atlantic Kevin M. Costello, Burlington Stephen P. DeNittis, Burlington Miriam S. Edelstein, Burlington Tommie Ann Gibney, Burlington

Tormie Ann Gibney, Burlington Jose W. Hemandez, Burlington Deborah L. Mains, Burlington Jacquelyn R. Matchett, Burlington Drake A. Bearden, Camden Esther E. Berezofsky, Camden Reno John Ciccotta, Camden John M. Dodig, Camden Michael A. Ferrara, Jr., Camden Thomas F. Fynn, III, Camden Michael A. Galpern, Camden Vann Helmer Camden

Michael A. Galpern, Camden Yaron Helmer, Camden David J. Karbasian, Camden Christine V. Lafferty, Camden Michelle C. Murtha, Camden Richard J. Talbot, Camden Heidi Ruth Weintraub, Camden Neidra S. Wilson, Camden Oliver T. Barry, Esq., Cape May Daniel E. Rosner, Cumberland

\* Past President

Hon. Glenn A. Grant, J.A.D. **Acting Director** Administrative Office of the Courts Attn: Rules Comments Hughes Justice Complex - P.O. Box 037

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0037

Dear Judge Grant:

On behalf of the 2,700 members of the New Jersey Association for Justice (NJAJ), thank you for the opportunity to comment on the Supreme Court Rules Committee Report.

NJAJ does not support the changes to R. 4:19-1 limiting a defense medical exam ("DME") to a matter "in the Law Division, Civil Part." Rule 6:4-3(c) states that the Rule applies to Special Civil Part with modification. Rule 5:1-1 along with the procedure in R. 5:3-3. Therefore, the Rule Change would mean that the Rule no longer permits DMEs in Special Civil Part or Tevis claims in the Family Part as well as any other proceeding where Part 4 Rules apply.

NJAJ does not support the changes to R. 4:19-2. NJAJ believes the language used in the proposed Rule is confusing as it states that the party serving the notice is the party that should apply for the protective order. The Supreme Court's holding in DiFiore v. Pezic, 254 N.J. 212 (2023) placed the burden on the party objecting to the presence of a thirdparty. Adding the clause to the last sentence "of the exam," would eliminate this contradiction with DiFiore. NJAJ also has concerns with the short time frame of fourteen days' notice of the party seeking to utilize a third-party observer because the amount of information required is substantial, and it would be difficult to comply in just fourteen days. That would give a party seeking to hire a nurse or other expert, would have to coordinate with the expert and obtain the CV to be served in just 14 days. In addition, the Rule and the DiFiore decision contemplate a third-party observer may be either an expert or a fact witness. But the Rule asks for a business address when a fact witness may not have a business address. The Rule also asks for a CV when a person like a neighbor, who was one of the third-party observers in DiFiore should not have to provide a CV to be a fact witness. The Rule should be clarified as follows: Once a notice for exam has been issued pursuant to Rule 4:19-1, the receiving party must, within thirty (30) days, inform the party serving notice of any intent to utilize a thirdparty observer or to record the examination, set forth the identity and business address of the third-party observer, if an expert, provide the third party observer's curriculum vitae, and advise if the third-party observer will serve as an expert or fact witness and, if any recording will be taken, state the method of recording.



Formerly the Association of Trial Lawyers of America - New Jersey

Hon. Glenn A. Grant, J.A.D. March 26, 2024 Page Two

If the party serving notice <u>of the exam</u> objects, the parties shall confer orally and if they cannot come to an agreement, the party serving notice may move for a protective order under Rule 4:10-3.

NJAJ recommends supporting the proposed expansion of Rule 4:22-1 that would bring the Rule in line with the federal request for admission rule. Members of NJAJ who support the change think the expansion would assist in cases involving experts, and being able to have parties admit opinions.

NJAJ does not support the removal of this paragraph <u>R.</u> 4:58-4 because the paragraph makes clear that it applies in cases where there is no joint and several liability, such as successive tortfeasor cases. Without this part of the Rule, given it had existed, it would be used by successive tortfeasors and other parties in cases where there is no joint and several liability, to which the Rule does not apply under the doctrine of *expressio unius est exclusio alterius*.

Respectfully,

Patricia M. Giordano, Esq.

P.m. Giardano

President

cc: Cornelius J. Larkin, CAE, CMP, CEM, CMM, DES